



November 08, 2021

Shannon Hicks, P.E.  
Director of Public Works and Engineering Services

Town of Addison  
Addison Service Center  
16801 Westgrove Drive  
Addison, TX 75001

**RE: *Bella Lane South Extension and Alpha Road Connector Bid Results***  
***Project No.: 2021-01C***  
***Bid No.: 21-69***

Mr. Hicks,

On October 21, 2021, the Town of Addison received bids for the Bella Lane South Extension and Alpha Road Connector project. The two lowest bids received are listed below.

<b>Bidder</b>	<b>Total Bid</b>
DDM Construction Corporation (DDM)	\$2,928,224.66
Tiseo Paving Company (Tiseo)	\$2,999,910.66

Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc. (Kimley-Horn) has reviewed both bids and contacted references for both bidders.

The following irregularities were observed in DDM's bid.

- On page BQS-2 in Section BQS of the bid documents it states, "The Contractor shall show that he has experience with similar projects that require working on concrete pavement, water, storm sewer, detention pond, and bridge construction in close proximity to many physical features (such as: fences, carpools, utility poles, guy lines, gas lines and meters, water lines, sewer manholes and cleanouts, etc.) which will require the Contractor to plan his work efforts and equipment needs with these limitations in mind." At the time of bid, DDM did not demonstrate that they have worked on a project (current or complete) that included bridge construction.
- On page BQS-2 in Section BQS of the bid documents it states, "The Contractor shall submit a complete list of ALL Municipal and Similar Non-Municipal current and completed projects for the past three (3) years for review." DDM did not list all current projects. Kimley-Horn learned of a current project in the City of Irving that was not identified as well as other recent past projects for other municipalities.
- On page BQS-5 in Section BQS of the bid documents it requires "Type(s) of Work to be done by Sub-contractors" to be included with the bidder qualifications. DDM did not include a qualified bridge subcontractor in their sub-contractors for the project when submitting their bid proposal since they did not identify previous in-house bridge project experience.

Kimley-Horn contacted references provided by DDM. None of the projects provided included bridge construction. The references with whom we spoke indicated that they would work with DDM again.

Kimley Horn learned of other projects performed by DDM that they did not list in the required bid forms (at least one current and one past) that had issues throughout the project and staff turnover. In addition, both projects incurred liquidated damages. Kimley-Horn learned of these projects independently and reached out to those respective municipalities.

Kimley-Horn contacted references provided by Tiseo. The projects listed were representative of this project and several included bridge construction.

Tiseo did provide project experience that includes bridge construction, and they did include a bridge sub-contractor in their qualifications included with their bid proposal. Tiseo's projects were completed on time and within budget. The references with whom we spoke indicated that they would work with Tiseo again.

It is our understanding that based on bid submittal requirements and irregularities identified in DDM's bid package submittal, the Town of Addison may determine that DDM's bid is considered non-responsive. In addition, they have no previous identified project experience with bridge construction which is a major element of this project.

With that understanding and based on the information gathered, it does not appear that DDM meets the qualifications for the project and has bid irregularities rendering their bid package non-responsive. It appears Tiseo's bid package is the lowest responsive bid and meets the qualifications for the project. Therefore, based on the information provided, Kimley-Horn recommends awarding the contract to Tiseo.

Enclosed is a copy of the bid tabulation for your reference.  
Sincerely,

KIMLEY-HORN AND ASSOCIATES, INC.



Brian J. LaFoy, P.E., ENV SP



Project Name: Bella Lane South Extension & Alpha Road Connector

Project No. 2021-01C

Town of Addison, Texas  
Date: 10/25/2021  
KHA Job No. 63543031

Legend
RED text indicates a calculation error on the bidders submitted bid form, but it is corrected on bid tab for accuracy.

Item No.	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	BIDDER 1		BIDDER 2		BIDDER 3		BIDDER 4		BIDDER 5		BIDDER 6		BIDDER 7	
				Unit Price	Item Cost	Unit Price	Item Cost	Unit Price	Item Cost	Unit Price	Item Cost	Unit Price	Item Cost	Unit Price	Item Cost	Unit Price	Item Cost
<b>BASE BID - DETENTION POND IMPROVEMENTS</b>																	
H1	UNCLASSIFIED POND AND CREEK EXCAVATION	1	LS	\$140,000.00	\$140,000.00	\$60,375.00	\$60,375.00	\$80,000.00	\$80,000.00	\$165,000.00	\$165,000.00	\$500,000.00	\$500,000.00	\$280,000.00	\$280,000.00	\$100,634.68	\$100,634.68
H2	BORROW AND SPOIL (DETENTION POND AND CREEK)	1	LS	\$3,600.00	\$3,600.00	\$6,300.00	\$6,300.00	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$26,000.00	\$26,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$145,000.00	\$145,000.00	\$34,420.45	\$34,420.45
H3	BORROW AND SPOIL (DETENTION POND AND CREEK) (SELECT FILL)	1	LS	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$28,224.00	\$28,224.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$55,000.00	\$55,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$18,000.00	\$18,000.00	\$25,892.04	\$25,892.04
H4	RIPRAP (CONC) (CL B) (RR&RR9) (DETENTION POND)	6	CY	\$700.00	\$4,200.00	\$716.10	\$4,296.60	\$700.00	\$4,200.00	\$363.00	\$2,178.00	\$615.00	\$3,690.00	\$800.00	\$4,800.00	\$1,181.46	\$7,088.76
H5	RIPRAP (STONE PROTECTION) (24 IN) (DETENTION POND)	910	CY	\$150.00	\$136,500.00	\$110.25	\$100,327.50	\$165.00	\$150,150.00	\$200.00	\$182,000.00	\$110.00	\$100,100.00	\$170.00	\$154,700.00	\$107.57	\$97,888.70
H6	CONCRETE OUTFALL STRUCTURE	7	CY	\$1,300.00	\$9,100.00	\$2,415.00	\$16,905.00	\$2,500.00	\$17,500.00	\$850.00	\$5,950.00	\$1,100.00	\$7,700.00	\$1,200.00	\$8,400.00	\$1,181.47	\$8,270.29
<b>TOTAL: BASE BID - DETENTION POND IMPROVEMENTS TOTAL</b>					<b>\$333,400.00</b>		<b>\$216,428.10</b>		<b>\$321,850.00</b>		<b>\$436,128.00</b>		<b>\$656,490.00</b>		<b>\$610,900.00</b>		<b>\$274,194.92</b>
<b>BASE BID - LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS AND EROSION CONTROL</b>																	
L1	HYDRAULIC MULCHING WITH 4" TOPSOIL	45,490	SY	\$1.60	\$72,784.00	\$2.89	\$131,466.10	\$4.50	\$204,705.00	\$2.50	\$113,725.00	\$1.30	\$59,137.00	\$1.00	\$45,490.00	\$3.03	\$137,834.70
L2	SEDIMENT CONTROL FENCE (INSTALL/MAINTAIN/REMOVE)	7,475	LF	\$3.60	\$26,910.00	\$1.68	\$12,558.00	\$2.18	\$16,295.50	\$2.24	\$16,744.00	\$4.00	\$29,900.00	\$3.79	\$28,330.25	\$2.62	\$19,584.50
L3	STABILIZED CONSTRUCTION EXIT/ENTRANCE	180	SY	\$28.00	\$5,040.00	\$31.50	\$5,670.00	\$31.00	\$5,580.00	\$16.00	\$2,880.00	\$31.69	\$5,704.20	\$40.00	\$7,200.00	\$19.16	\$3,448.80
L4	INLET PROTECTION (INSTALL/MAINTAIN/REMOVE)	4	EA	\$270.00	\$1,080.00	\$141.75	\$567.00	\$475.00	\$1,900.00	\$1,200.00	\$4,800.00	\$584.08	\$2,336.32	\$585.00	\$2,340.00	\$139.93	\$559.72
L5	ROCK CHECK DAM	65	LF	\$80.00	\$5,200.00	\$42.00	\$2,730.00	\$40.00	\$2,600.00	\$30.00	\$1,950.00	\$56.49	\$3,671.85	\$60.00	\$3,900.00	\$40.88	\$2,657.20
L6	STORM WATER POLLUTION PREVENTION PLAN	1	LS	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$8,500.00	\$8,500.00	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$180,000.00	\$180,000.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$4,939.48	\$4,939.48
<b>TOTAL: BASE BID - LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS AND EROSION CONTROL TOTAL</b>					<b>\$112,014.00</b>		<b>\$161,491.10</b>		<b>\$271,080.50</b>		<b>\$147,099.00</b>		<b>\$280,749.37</b>		<b>\$89,760.25</b>		<b>\$169,024.40</b>
<b>BASE BID - WATER IMPROVEMENTS</b>																	
W1	8" PVC WATER LINE	355	LF	\$82.00	\$29,110.00	\$81.90	\$29,074.50	\$85.00	\$30,175.00	\$172.00	\$61,060.00	\$60.00	\$21,300.00	\$120.00	\$42,600.00	\$111.95	\$39,742.25
W2	12" PVC WATER LINE	575	LF	\$110.00	\$63,250.00	\$98.70	\$56,752.50	\$103.00	\$59,225.00	\$208.00	\$119,600.00	\$62.00	\$35,650.00	\$125.00	\$71,875.00	\$124.21	\$71,420.75
W3	8" GATE VALVE	2	EA	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$1,890.00	\$3,780.00	\$2,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$2,865.00	\$5,730.00	\$1,500.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,600.00	\$7,200.00	\$2,249.06	\$4,498.12
W4	12" GATE VALVE	2	EA	\$4,000.00	\$8,000.00	\$3,255.00	\$6,510.00	\$3,400.00	\$6,800.00	\$4,350.00	\$8,700.00	\$2,200.00	\$4,400.00	\$5,500.00	\$11,000.00	\$3,543.98	\$7,087.96
W5	FIRE HYDRANT ASSEMBLY	1	EA	\$4,100.00	\$4,100.00	\$4,935.00	\$4,935.00	\$5,100.00	\$5,100.00	\$4,650.00	\$4,650.00	\$3,200.00	\$3,200.00	\$10,500.00	\$10,500.00	\$4,082.14	\$4,082.14
W6	REMOVE EXISTING 12" AC WATER LINE	8	LF	\$400.00	\$3,200.00	\$42.00	\$336.00	\$44.00	\$352.00	\$615.00	\$4,920.00	\$101.00	\$808.00	\$125.00	\$1,000.00	\$115.02	\$920.16
W7	ABANDON EXISTING ASBESTOS PIPE IN PLACE	500	LF	\$30.00	\$15,000.00	\$21.00	\$10,500.00	\$22.00	\$11,000.00	\$30.00	\$15,000.00	\$175.00	\$87,500.00	\$28.00	\$14,000.00	\$17.67	\$8,835.00
W8	WATER TESTING	1	LS	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$1,312.50	\$1,312.50	\$1,300.00	\$1,300.00	\$2,910.00	\$2,910.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$6,500.00	\$6,500.00	\$2,802.50	\$2,802.50
W9	TRENCH EXCAVATION PROTECTION (WATER SYSTEM)	930	LF	\$1.00	\$930.00	\$1.05	\$976.50	\$1.10	\$1,023.00	\$1.45	\$1,348.50	\$1.00	\$930.00	\$2.00	\$1,860.00	\$1.03	\$957.90
<b>TOTAL: BASE BID - WATER IMPROVEMENTS TOTAL</b>					<b>\$132,090.00</b>		<b>\$114,177.00</b>		<b>\$118,975.00</b>		<b>\$223,918.50</b>		<b>\$164,288.00</b>		<b>\$166,535.00</b>		<b>\$140,346.78</b>
<b>BASE BID - SANITARY SEWER IMPROVEMENTS</b>																	
SS1	8" PVC SSWR LINE	315	LF	\$61.00	\$19,215.00	\$54.60	\$17,199.00	\$58.00	\$18,270.00	\$170.00	\$53,550.00	\$60.00	\$18,900.00	\$105.00	\$33,075.00	\$59.65	\$18,789.75
SS2	4' STANDARD MANHOLE	1	EA	\$5,100.00	\$5,100.00	\$6,510.00	\$6,510.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$5,065.00	\$5,065.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$6,054.83	\$6,054.83
SS3	CEMENT STABILIZED SAND ENCASUREMENT (MIN. 10% CEMENT/CY)	20	LF	\$60.00	\$1,200.00	\$47.25	\$945.00	\$50.00	\$1,000.00	\$195.00	\$3,900.00	\$30.00	\$600.00	\$37.00	\$740.00	\$97.17	\$1,943.40
SS4	SANITARY SEWER CCTV INSPECTION	1	LS	\$720.00	\$720.00	\$661.50	\$661.50	\$700.00	\$700.00	\$2,910.00	\$2,910.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$21,924.90	\$21,924.90
SS5	TRENCH EXCAVATION PROTECTION (SANITARY SEWER IMPROVEMENTS)	315	LF	\$2.00	\$630.00	\$1.05	\$330.75	\$1.10	\$346.50	\$2.80	\$882.00	\$4.80	\$1,512.00	\$2.00	\$630.00	\$1.02	\$321.30
<b>TOTAL: BASE BID - SANITARY SEWER IMPROVEMENTS TOTAL</b>					<b>\$26,865.00</b>		<b>\$25,646.25</b>		<b>\$27,316.50</b>		<b>\$66,307.00</b>		<b>\$47,012.00</b>		<b>\$49,945.00</b>		<b>\$49,034.18</b>
<b>BASE BID - SANITARY SEWER IMPROVEMENTS</b>																	
O1	OWNER'S CONTINGENCY	1	LS	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00
<b>TOTAL: BASE BID - OWNER'S CONTINGENCY TOTAL</b>					<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT BASE BID - STREET IMPROVEMENTS</b>					<b>\$1,138,497.99</b>		<b>\$1,406,380.86</b>		<b>\$1,406,960.70</b>		<b>\$1,443,115.00</b>		<b>\$1,574,126.00</b>		<b>\$1,554,012.15</b>		<b>\$2,289,589.76</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT BRIDGE OVER FARMERS BRANCH CREEK</b>					<b>\$926,226.00</b>		<b>\$818,204.10</b>		<b>\$787,237.50</b>		<b>\$970,108.00</b>		<b>\$712,370.00</b>		<b>\$890,586.00</b>		<b>\$742,047.66</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT BASE BID - STORM SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS</b>					<b>\$174,132.00</b>		<b>\$172,583.25</b>		<b>\$179,912.00</b>		<b>\$248,444.00</b>		<b>\$135,582.00</b>		<b>\$216,240.00</b>		<b>\$169,913.38</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT BASE BID - DETENTION POND IMPROVEMENTS</b>					<b>\$333,400.00</b>		<b>\$216,428.10</b>		<b>\$321,850.00</b>		<b>\$436,128.00</b>		<b>\$656,490.00</b>		<b>\$610,900.00</b>		<b>\$274,194.92</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT BASE BID - LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS AND EROSION CONTROL</b>					<b>\$112,014.00</b>		<b>\$161,491.10</b>		<b>\$271,080.50</b>		<b>\$147,099.00</b>		<b>\$280,749.37</b>		<b>\$89,760.25</b>		<b>\$169,024.40</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT BASE BID - WATER IMPROVEMENTS</b>					<b>\$132,090.00</b>		<b>\$114,177.00</b>		<b>\$118,975.00</b>		<b>\$223,918.50</b>		<b>\$164,288.00</b>		<b>\$166,535.00</b>		<b>\$140,346.78</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT BASE BID - SANITARY SEWER IMPROVEMENTS</b>					<b>\$26,865.00</b>		<b>\$25,646.25</b>		<b>\$27,316.50</b>		<b>\$66,307.00</b>		<b>\$47,012.00</b>		<b>\$49,945.00</b>		<b>\$49,034.18</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT BASE BID - SANITARY SEWER IMPROVEMENTS</b>					<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>		<b>\$85,000.00</b>
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT AWARDED</b>					<b>\$2,928,224.99</b>		<b>\$2,999,910.66</b>		<b>\$3,198,332.20</b>		<b>\$3,620,119.50</b>		<b>\$3,655,617.37</b>		<b>\$3,662,978.40</b>		<b>\$3,919,151.08</b>